City of Cape May Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes Monday, August 26, 2013

Opening: The regular meeting of the City of Cape May Historic Preservation Commission

was called to order by Chairman Coupland at 6:30 PM. In Compliance with the

Open Public Meetings Act, adequate notice of this meeting was provided.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Roll Call:

Mr. Coupland, Chairman Present

Mr. Fontaine, Vice Chairman Absent - **excused**

Mr. Carroll Present
Mr. Clemans Present
Mr. Cogswell Present
Mr. Furlin Present
Mrs. Hartman Absent

Mr. Connolly Alt. 1 Present Mrs. Pontin Alt. 2 Present

Also Present: Robert A. Fineberg, Esquire – Commission Solicitor

Edie Kopsitz, Secretary

Absent: Deanna Fiocca, Council Liaison

Minutes: July 22, 2013

Motion made by Mr. Cogswell to approve the Minutes of July 22, 2013 as presented. Seconded by Mr. Furlin and carried 7-0. Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Clemans, Mr. Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly, Mrs. Pontin and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

Resolutions:

Beauchamp, 329 Congress Street, 1031/61, Contributing-HD, Resolution #2013-09 Macedonia Baptist Church, 632-636 Lafayette St, 1059/2, Contributing-HD, Resolution#2013-10 McCarthy, 712-714 Kearney Street, 1064/2, Non Contributing-HD, Resolution#2013-11 CBB LLC (CHEW), 502 Bank Street, 1040/2.05, Non Contributing-HD, Resolution#2013-12 Paul Burgin Builders, Inc, 933 Corgie Street, 1093/10, Contributing-HD, Resolution#2013-13

Motion made by Mr. Furlin to approve Resolutions # 2013-09, 2013-10, 2013-11, 2013-12 and 2013-13 as presented. Seconded by Mr. Clemans and carried 7-0. Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Clemans, Mr. Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly, Mrs. Pontin and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

Applications approved in Review:

Stridick, 24 Congress Street, 1024/5, Key – HD, Roof (Cedar)
DiDonato, 1136-1138 Lafayette Street, Contributing–HD, Final Plans
Wardell, 819 Benton Avenue, 1073/19, Contributing-HD, Roof
Blue Pig/Congress Hall, 251 Beach Avenue, 1028/1.01, Key-HD, Chimney/Gates

Lieb, 1006 Washington Street, 1110/2, Contributing-HD, Porch repair Wyka, 817 Jefferson Street, 1092/35, Non Contributing-HD, Shed

Motion made by Mr. Carroll to accept the Applications Approved in Review as presented. Seconded by Mr. Connolly and **carried 7-0.** Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Clemans, Mr. Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly, Mrs. Pontin and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

BUSINESS:

HARRIS......27 SECOND AVENUE CHANGE OF PROPERTY STATUS RATING – BLK 1014 LOT 23 (CONTRIBUTING – HD)

Stephen Nehmad, Esquire representing the owner James Harris who was present along with Mark Asher, Architect of Asher & Associates. Mr. Nehmad is requesting that the Contributing Status that was designated on March 19, 2013 by Ordinance #264-2013 be changed to Non-Contributing. He stated that prior to the current property report this structure has never been rated but considered Non-Contributing. He contends his clients are questioning the notice process indicating they received notice but do to their primary residence location did not respond. Mr. Nehmad reviewed the report that was submitted with the application by George E. Thomas PHD, Architectural Historian dated July 15, 2013 indicating that the structure is not of exceptional character and should not be rated "Contributing" as the property report indicates. He stated in the case of this building, its massive alterations to character-defining features, its deterioration, and its lack of the design significance all act to undermine the character and quality is presumed in Cape May's Historic district.

Members were afforded time for questions to Mr. Nehmad and raised questions of designation changes and notice process to Mr. Fineberg who instructed how to proceed. Members reviewed the report form George E. Thomas, PHD and the Property Report conducted by Preservation Design Partnership, LLC(PDP) dated September 23, 2011. All members concurred that the property is a bungalow style (fisherman's cottage) of which many similar homes have been demolished and replaced by larger homes. The remaining bungalow style homes, though very modest, have contributing value to the Historic District as last examples of the style. Members support the report conducted by PDP and the Contributing status.

Motion made by Mr. Cogswell for approval of the application as presented. Seconded by Mr. Carroll and **denied 5-2.** Those in favor: Mr. Carroll and Mrs. Pontin. Those opposed: Mr. Clemans, Mr. Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly and Mr. Coupland. Those abstaining: None.

Louis Dwyer, Esquire representing the Owners Gary and Deborah Snyder who were not present. The Snyder's received approval November 26, 2016 by Resolution #2012-43 and previous owner McCarthy received approval August 22, 2011 by Resolution #2011-22. They are requesting a Demolition permit (noting they can't be extended). Mr. Dwyer explained the family has incurred a personal tragedy and are unable to move forward with the demolition this year.

Motion made by Mr. Carroll for approval of the application as presented. Seconded by Mr. Clemans and **carried 7-0.** Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Clemans, Mr. Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly, Mrs. Pontin and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

HAVILAND......1317 NEW YORK AVENUE SIDING RENOVATION - BLK 1148 LOT 27.02, 28 & 29 (CONTRIBUTING - HD)

Louis Dwyer, Esquire representing the applicant Paul and Karen Haviland along with their professional Christina Amey, Architect were present. The photographs enclosed with the packet distributed to the members were incorrect and replaced with the current photographs of the property marked into evidence as A-1. They are proposing extensive interior renovations along with exterior improvements that include siding requesting the use of painted hardiboard (currently has rotted wood clapboard with asbestos covering), replace wood railings with same, HVAC Unit platform (wood), Stairs replace in kind (wood), Columns replace in kind (wood), Brick veneer on base, wood privacy lattice and Roofs – slate & asphalt shingles.

Members were afforded time for questions throughout the presentation. Concerns regarding the replacement of siding on a contributing structure were discussed at length with Members suggesting removal of the asbestos covering on the clapboard to see the condition and informed of how others were pleasantly surprised by being able to restore the clapboard. Members informed the applicant that it is a Contributing Structure and manmade material are not permitted as per the Design Standards. **Mr. Dwyer requested 2 minutes to confer with his clients at 7:18pm, returned @ 7:20pm and** agreed to table the application so sections of siding could be removed to determine the state of the siding. Members will be noticed so they could view the siding.

Motion made by Mr. Cogswell to table the application until the next available meeting with Counsel agreeing to waive all time constraints. Seconded by Mr. Carroll with a request that several areas of asbestos be removed for a thorough examination and carried 7-0. Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Clemans, Mr. Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly, Mrs. Pontin and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

Louis Dwyer, Esquire representing the owner Scott Thomas whom was present along with his professional Mark Lovell, Architect. Mr. Dwyer explained the proposed renovation received Conceptual approval on May 13, 2013 of the project with the notes from the Members regarding the barge boards, pendant, shutters for the 2nd floor windows and a detailed railing system with a strong top rail. A revised plan dated July 29, 2013 that incorporated requests from the HPC continuing the siding to the base of the structure and the railing systems and the Zoning Board request to omit the overhang of the gable façade that encroached on the adjoining property. Materials; Roof – Asphalt shingles, Facia – Hardi Board, Soffits – Hardi Board, Siding – Hardi Board, Window Trim – Hardi Board, Doors – Andersen French, Aluminum/Glass – Front Entry, Rear Door, Railings – Perma Porch Aluminum railing, Decking – Azek (over balcony), Exterior Lighting – LED to match existing.

Members were positive on the application and commended the applicant for the revisions stating it enhances the look of the structure. Members Carroll and Cogswell requested clarification on the wood width on the gingerbread detailing and railing dimensions.

Motion made by Mr. Carroll be approved based on all the dimensional information received this evening with the one change that the balustrades be an 1 1/2 " thick with not more than 3" in between the ends of each balustrade. All the mentioned should be denoted in the Construction drawings and to be presented for HPC Review. Seconded by Mr. Clemans and carried 7-0. Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Clemans, Mr.

Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly, Mrs. Pontin and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

RICART......314 JEFFERSON STREET ROOF (MATERIAL CHANGE) – BLK 1073 LOT 13 (CONTRIBUTING – HD)

Chairman Coupland recused himself from the application and Member Carroll resumed the responsibility as Chairman do to the absence of Vice Chairman Fontaine.

Louis Dwyer, Esquire representing Mr. & Mrs. Luis Ricart who were present along with their professional Tony Paoli, Dave Adams Roofing. He referred to the property report dated 1993 that was vague and the applicant is requesting to replace a deteriorated roof (with rolled asphalt covering in poor condition) with an asphalt roof that will replicate the cedar shake roof, he also verified that the roof was not original to the structure and had been placed incorrectly about 30 years ago (there is no evidence of wood down to the rafters). Mr. Dwyer emphasized that the building is contributing and stated numerous other colonial revival houses in the area have asphalt roofs. The house had been raised about seven (7) feet in 1968. He shared with the Members that a cedar shake roof would be a hardship to the owners do to the cost that they cannot afford. He stated the roof is not the focal point of the home as it is concealed by the Gables and a Colonial Revival Style doesn't require wood roofs. Mr. Paoli clarified the cost of wood roof versus the asphalt and verified the fact that no evidence of wood roof down to the rafters.

Members were positive on the application stating the roof is not visible and what is being proposed will be an upgrade. They also referred to the application that indicated there currently is a wood roof which was not factual with Mr. Dwyer clarifying for the record.

Motion made by Mr. Cogswell to approve the application as presented. Seconded by Mr. Connolly and carried 6-0. Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Clemans, Mr. Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly and Mrs. Pontin. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

Chariman Coupland resumed his duties.

FROSCHLE......32 JACKSON STREET RENOVATION/ADDITITON – BLK 1034 LOT 4 (CONTRIBUTING – HD)

Louis Dwyer, Esquire representing the owners Thomas and Alison Froschle who were present along with their professional Christina Amey, Architect. The building is the Puffin Condominium that has five (5) units and the owners of 2^{nd} floor rear unit is the applicants unit. They are proposing a 127 square foot addition entry and roof deck that will not be visible from the street. Using the plans dated June 12, 2013 by Christina Amey Architect LLC, denoting the existing and proposed elevations inclusive of all sides' front and rear. The plan of property by Stephen C. Martinelli dated June 27, 2013 were perused by the members. The materials proposed – Roof – flat torch down, Facia, Soffits and siding – cedar to match existing, Windows – Marvin Wood Ultimate Double Hung, Window Trim – Wood (cedar), Doors – Marvin Wood Ultimate, Columns, 8 x 8 Cedar post, Railing – Cedar and Decking – Cedar.

Members were positive on the application indicating that it will not be visible from the street and will be utilitarian for the owners. Mr. Carroll wanted it noted for the record that the address on the plans state 35 Jackson and new plans should indicated the appropriate address for final approval.

Motion made by Mr. Cogswell to grant Conceptual approval the application as presented. Seconded by Mr. Clemans and **carried 7-0.** Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Clemans, Mr. Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly, Mrs. Pontin and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

DANZI CONSTRUCTION CO, LLC......1106 MISSOURI AVENUE DEMOLITION/NEW CONSTRUCTION BLOCK 1125 LOT 5 (NON CONTRIBUTING – HD)

Anthony and Robert Danzi owners were present. They are requesting a demolition of a non contributing existing structure. Robert Danzi addressed the 9 points as in Cape May Code 525-40 for the record only 7 of the points were applicable.

Members all concurred the structure has no historical significance.

Motion made by Mr. Carroll to grant the demolition of the existing structure on Missouri Avenue. Seconded by Mr. Cogswell and **carried 7-0.** Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Clemans, Mr. Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly, Mrs. Pontin and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

Mr. R. Danzi reviewed his Preliminary Design Plans by Joseph A. Gates, dated August 21, 2013 that encompassed the Front, Rear, Left and Right Side Elevations along with the design of the three (3) Bedroom two (2) story Single Family home. The plans were void of dimensions. Mr. Carroll questioned the photograph of a proposed New Home in the package. Mr. Danzi responded it was just an example of the proposed construction (colorized as built). He elaborated that it is a craftsman style home with an attached garage. The materials proposed – Roof- Asphalt dimensional shingles, Windows – Anderson Woodwright and Siding – Hardiboard. Mr. Carroll asked if he had a survey of the property, questioning the lot frontage. Mr. Danzi responded he did not have a survey but the lot was 50ft. x 125ft.

Members were afforded time to question the applicant. Chairman Coupland clarified that with new construction it is understood that you follow a modern interpretation of one particular style. Members all concurred that there were several styles incorporated into this structure and felt it would not blend in with the streetscape emphasizing the prominent attached garage. Chairman Coupland suggested the applicant along with his Architect review the Design Standards and Members all encouraged details in the landscaping as well as the submission of a survey.

Motion made by Mr. Carroll to table the application for preliminary construction plans for the structure on Missouri Avenue. Seconded by Mr. Connolly and carried 7-0. Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Clemans, Mr. Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly, Mrs. Pontin and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

DRAKE......325 COGRESS STREET RENOVATIONS (STRUCTURE RAISED) BLOCK 1031 LOT 60 (CONTRIBUTING – HD)

Chris McDuell, General Contractor was present to represent the owner's along with their Architect Susan Boehret, Cape Cottage Design, PC. Ms. Boehret described the structure as a 1925 Sears House that must be raised to meet FEMA requirements. The house was built at ground level and incurred flooding (Super Storm Sandy) that collapsed a section of the main floor. Plans dated August 8, 2013 with a revision of August 26, 2013 were reviewed by the Commission with Ms. Boehret indicating that visually it will be a 9 ft increase in height (total 13ft above sea level to meet FEMA), with replacement of all windows, new windows on lower level (wood), new siding will match cedar shake (same for same) and introduction of a staircase to the Archway that exists (side entrance), along with a lower level floor described in detail the front & right side (inclusion

of the AC Units), rear elevations and 1^{st} & 2^{nd} floor plans and a Survey by Stephen Martinelli dated April 18, 2013.

Members were understanding of the applicant's position but shared their concerns at length regarding the cottage style structure that will be altered because of the elevation. Chairman Coupland requested the applicant reconsider the location of the AC and place the high velocity unit in the attic, that will reduce the raising by a foot to resemble the structure at 329 Congress Street (next door that was raised). They understand the condensers would be located on the platform but there would be a reduction. Mr. McDuell and Ms. Boehret responded that they will have the HVAC contractor review and then revised the Construction Plan to reflect the reduction in height. Member Clemans had questions regarding the replacement windows regarding the cladding and lack original mechanisms (ropes/weights).

Motion made by Mr. Carroll for Conceptual Approval based on the discussion of minimizing the elevation by redesigning the AC systems and related equipment and also submitting it with a detailed landscaping plan to conceal the new construction below the Historic Building. Seconded by Mr. Connolly and carried 7-0. Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Clemans, Mr. Cogswell, Mr. Furlin, Mr. Connolly, Mrs. Pontin and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

The meeting was open to the public at 8:35pm with no one coming forward the public portion was closed.

Discussion was entered regarding the award of \$25,000 (a no matching funds grant) by the State Historic Preservation Office to the City of Cape May for the ongoing process of our Survey's (property reports) and thanked Edie Kopsitz for her diligence in filing the Grant Application. Chairman Coupland opened the discussion regarding the Wind Turbine issue and was updated by Member Connolly (also School Board President) informing the Commission that a letter was sent to the City's Attorney Mr. Monzo requesting a meeting. Mr. Fineberg gave the legal opinion as Commission Attorney and clarified as the City of Cape May Elementary School Board Solicitor.

Motion to adjourn the meeting was made by Mr. Connolly, seconded by Mr. Carroll with all in favor at 8:45 pm.

A verbatim recording of said meeting is on file at the Construction/Zoning Office.

Respectfully submitted: Edie Kopsitz – Secretary