City of Cape May Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Minutes Monday, June 25, 2012

Opening: The regular meeting of the City of Cape May Historic Preservation

Commission was called to order by Board Chairperson Warren Coupland at 6:30 PM. In Compliance with the Open Public Meetings Act, adequate

notice of this meeting was provided.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Roll Call:

Mr. Coupland, Chairman Present
Mr. Fontaine, Vice Chairman Present
Mr. Carroll Present
Mr. Clemans Present
Mr. Cogswell Present
Mr. Masemore Present
Mrs. Hartman Present

Mr. Furlin Alt. 1 Absent - excused

Mr. Connolly Alt. 2 Present

Also Present: Edie Kopsitz, Secretary

Robert Fineberg, Esquire – Commission Solicitor

Absent: Deanna Fiocca, Council Liaison

Minutes: May 31, 2012 and June 11, 2012

Motion made by Mr. Cogswell to approve the minutes of May 31 and June 11, 2012. Seconded by Mrs. Hartman and **carried 7-0.** Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Cogswell Mr. Clemans, Mrs. Hartman, Mr. Masemore, Mr. Fontaine and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

Resolutions:

Broadway Beach (Hand), 201-211 Beach Avenue, 1016/13 - Resolution #2012-15 Lamplighter Condominium Association, 1001 Washington St, 1111/11 - Resolution#2012-16 Tillman "The Abbey", 34 Gurney Street, 1056/3, Resolution #2012-17 Furlong & Hickman, 1105 New York Avenue, 1117/36 & 37, Resolution #2012-18 Jordan, 911 Corgie Street, 1093/16, Resolution #2012-19 Bonk, 309 Franklin Street, 1073/15, Resolution #2012-20 Ocean Club Hotel C.M. LLC, 1035 Beach Avenue, 1101/2,3,4, Resolution #2012-21 Pasternak, 657 Hughes Street, 1058/17, Resolution #2012-22 Tillman "The Abbey", 34 Gurney Street, 1056/3, Resolution #2012-23

Motion made by Mr. Carroll to approve Resolutions #2012-015, 2012-016, 2012-17, 2012-18, 2012-19, 2012-20, 2012-21, 2012-22 and 2012-23. Seconded by Mr. Clemans and carried 7-0. Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Cogswell Mr. Clemans, Mrs. Hartman, Mr. Masemore, Mr. Fontaine and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: Mr. Cogswell on #2012-21 and #2012-23.

Applications approved in Review:

Calwell, 1009 Stockton Avenue, 1096/14, Contributing – HD, Sidewalk repairs MacLean, 1015 Beach Avenue, 1095/3, Contributing – HD, Fence DeGroff, 15 South Lafayette Street, 1021/4, Contributing – HD, Railing repair Morien, 1045 Washington Street, 1112/10, Contributing – HD, Wood Fence

Motion made by Mr. Fontaine to approve the Applications approved in Review. Seconded by Mr. Cogswell and carried 7-0. Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Cogswell Mr. Clemans, Mrs. Hartman, Mr. Masemore, Mr. Fontaine and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

BUSINESS:

Robert and Barbara Dreyfuss owners were present. They are requesting to replace a wood enclosed shower that is 5ft x 5ft x 7ft with a free standing wood shed 6ft x 5ft x 7ft. Mrs. Dreyfuss distributed packets **marked A-1** to all members with Mr. Dreyfuss explaining the photograph of the existing shower and the proposed shed. The material proposed; Roof – Architectural Style shakes, Wood siding, Wood Door, Window/glass pane and will be color coordinated to match the house.

Members were positive on the application but had concerns of the shed blending in with their shingled style house. Some members recommended that cedar shake be used on the siding and roof with others agreeing with the cedar siding. The applicants agreed to use cedar shake shingles on the siding and were apprehensive about the use on the roof but agreed and will contact their contractor. Members were in unison that the shutters depicted on the drawing not be used on the shed and the use of heavy white trim to match the house.

Motion made by Mr. Carroll be approved with the design presented dated June 25, 2012 marked Exhibit A-1, with the siding being cedar shake, with white trim, double or single swing door and no shutters. Seconded by Mr. Clemans and carried 7-0. Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Cogswell Mr. Clemans, Mrs. Hartman, Mr. Masemore, Mr. Fontaine and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

TERNOVE......719-721 FRANKLIN STREET FINAL – BLK 1080 LOT 32 (CONTRIBUTING – HD)

Patricia Ternove owner was present along with her professional Joseph Courter, Jr. AIA Architect. Mr. Courter gave a brief history of the property and the proposed work that applicant is requesting to remove the dilapidated one-story rear addition and construct a two-story rear addition in the same footprint, add a rear porch and delineated parking. They will remove all non-conforming siding, windows and restore with historically accurate materials for the windows, columns and railings and was conceptually approved on May 14, 2012. He indicated they received Zoning Board approval on May 24, 2012. Mr. Courter referred to his plans dated February 6, 2012 with a revision date of June 4, 2012 that denoted the materials. He informed the Commission that the existing main roof is asphalt shingles and the applicant is requesting to use a dimensional shingle instead of

the standing seam metal roof that was proposed (the standing seam metal roof will be used on the front and rear porch roofs only). The siding, soffits, fascia, window trim and railings will be cedar. The HVC enclosure will be cedar lattice 50/50. Doors will be solid wood. Windows will be restored original or wood replacement with true divided light. Decking will be tongue-in-groove kind. Columns will be boxed with cedar. Driveway and walkway will be stone/pavers. Exterior lighting will be appropriate as shown in drawings submitted.

Members were positive on the application with all agreeing to the main roof being asphalt shingles. Members profusely thanked and commended the applicant for undertaking a much needed renovation.

Motion made by Mr. Masemore to approve the application as presented with Mr. Cogswell interjecting an amendment of the roofing material on the main roof be asphalt shingles. Seconded by Mrs. Hartman and carried 7-0. Those in favor: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Cogswell Mr. Clemans, Mrs. Hartman, Mr. Masemore, Mr. Fontaine and Mr. Coupland. Those opposed: None. Those abstaining: None.

Dale Hardin owner was present along with his professional Paul Kazlov of Global Home Improvement Company. The applicant is requesting to replace a cedar shake roof for a standing seam metal roof. The application was tabled on June 11, 2012 so the applicant's professional could further research the roofing material. Mr. Kazlov disbursed a packet marked A-1 dated June 25, 2012 that included multiple photographs of shingle-style homes, photographs of Macomber's structural history, excerpt from Cape May Shingle Style Roof Guidelines, page headed Importance of Roofs Pitch, photographs of various metal roofs, various wood shake warranties depicting their limited coverage, standingseam metal warranty and three additional cedar shake warranties. He indicated that the present pitch of the roof is not steep enough for installation of a long lasting cedar shake. Mr. Kazlov gave a brief history of the fire in 1938 with a rebuild with a different hipped roof reconfiguration. He also stated that a change was made to the roof in 1951 that eliminated the original roof and added a floor and a lower sloping roof pitch. He explained that the current cedar shake roof was installed 17 years ago and has endured significant damage with numerous leaks occurring each year. Mr. Kazlov promoted the use of his Metal Roofing product and gave a detailed warranty explanation. He believes the metal roof will blend in with the existing streetscape and will uphold to the elements on the beach front. Dale Hardin informed the membership of all the renovations that he has done and how he has always been mindful of the historic features. He also informed the members of the complications he has experienced with the cedar shake roof and all the damage he has incurred. He stated for the record the hardship he has experienced and placing cedar shake back on with the pitch of the current roof is not practical.

Members were allotted time for questions and complimented Mr. Kazlov for a thorough presentation. Members were sympathetic of the financial burden the applicant has incurred but explained in detail that they are charged with the responsibility of adhering to the Design Standards that are incorporated with the City of Cape May Zoning Ordinance §525-39A and are based upon the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. Chairman Coupland informed Mr. Hardin of Cape May City Historic Landmark status being under the Watch List and explained in detail what it means. The Design Standards page 54 was often referred with all members concurring they must adhere to them. They also explained the proper application of a cedar shake roof and the durability it has. Members

also stated that the roof of the Macomber has always been cedar shake and the proposed roof (standing seam metal) would be detrimental to the historic integrity of the building as well as the District. Discussion was entered regarding other Key structures that have been before the Commission with the same request and were given approval for a Cedar Shake roof only.

Motion made by Mr. Carroll to approve the application as presented. Seconded by Mr. Clemans and was denied 7-0. Those in favor: None. Those opposed: Mr. Carroll, Mr. Cogswell Mr. Clemans, Mrs. Hartman, Mr. Masemore, Mr. Fontaine and Mr. Coupland. Those abstaining: None.

Mr. Fineberg apprised the applicant of the procedures of the Historic Preservation Commission after a denial. Mr. Kazlov requested to see files of roofs that have been approved. Edie Kopsitz explained all minutes and resolutions are on file and he can view them. Mr. Fineberg suggested Mr. Kazlov review only the files dated from 2002 when the Design Standards were adopted. Mr. Hardin shared his displeasure with the Commission.

OPEN TO PUBLIC: The meeting was open to the public at 8:28 pm with no others coming forward the public portion was closed.

Discussion was entered regarding the revised amendments of the Design Standards and the group of Survey's that were forwarded to Council. Mr. Coupland informed the Commission that he is drafting a letter to the Mayor and City Manager regarding the matter. Mr. Carroll wanted the status of the signage for Stewarts Root Beer; Edie Kopsitz informed him it was reported to Code Enforcement and the Construction Official. Washington Commons was discussed regarding the inappropriate neon signs on several stores and Chairman Coupland will be meeting with the Construction Official regarding all topics brought up this evening.

Motion to adjourn made by Mr. Cogswell seconded by Mrs. Hartman with all in favor at 8:35 pm.

A verbatim recording of said meeting is on file at the Construction/Zoning Office.

Respectfully submitted: Edie Kopsitz - Secretary