

**TOWN OF CAPE ELIZABETH
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT**

10 Cooper Drive
Cape Elizabeth, ME 04107



Jay Reynolds
Public Works Director
(207) 799-4151
Fax: (207) 799-4426
jay.reynolds@capeelizabeth.org

To: Matthew Sturgis, Town Manager
From: Jay Reynolds, Director of Public Works
Date: June 22, 2021
Re: Review of Loader/Backhoe Bids

As you know, the Town recently issued an RFP for the above-stated equipment purchase. The loader/backhoe is approved for funding/purchase in FY'22. The budgeted amount is \$160,000.

RFP Release Date: May 12, 2021

RFP Bid Opening Date/Time: June 3, 2021, 2:00 PM

RFP Notice: Town Website and Mailing

RFP link:

<https://www.capeelizabeth.com/media/RequestsforProposals/2021/Loader%20Backhoe%20RFP%202021.pdf>

Bids Received: The Town received four bids. The bidder, equipment type, and bid amounts are as follows:

- | | | |
|-----------------------|------------------|--------------|
| • Beaugard Equipment: | Case 580N: | \$103,060.70 |
| • Nortrax: | John Deere 310SL | \$107,000.00 |
| • Milton Cat: | Caterpillar 420: | \$108,900.00 |
| • Beaugard Equipment: | Case 580SN: | \$111,918.03 |

Bid Review: The bids were reviewed by various Public Works Staff, including the PW Supervisor, Lead Mechanic, two Equipment Operators, and myself. Bids were reviewed against the criteria outline in the RFP. The purpose of the additional criteria separate from cost, is to consider other factors that have future cost implications associated with them. Additionally, two equipment operators tested each equipment. The RFP criteria are:

1. Cost
2. Adherence to Specifications
3. Parts Availability and Servicing
4. Operational Use/Durability/Effectiveness

Below is a summary of the review for each category:

1. Cost: The bids as outlined above show them from lowest to highest. Additionally, warranty information was requested in the RFP. While Nortrax and Beaugard are providing a 1-year warrantee (and 2 years on the powertrain), Milton Cat provided a 5-year full machine warranty. This difference in warranty has cost implications, as it will potentially lower the risk of future maintenance/defects/warranty costs for an additional 4 years beyond the other three bids. In my experience, warranty items often arise after the warranty expires. This can lead to additional costs.
2. Adherence to specifications: Beaugard Equipment did not list any deviations from the specifications, while Nortrax and Milton Cat noted only one or two minor deviations. In summary, all bids were very close to the same ranking in this category.

**TOWN OF CAPE ELIZABETH
PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT**

10 Cooper Drive
Cape Elizabeth, ME 04107



Jay Reynolds
Public Works Director
(207) 799-4151
Fax: (207) 799-4426
jay.reynolds@capeelizabeth.org

3. Parts Availability/Servicing: All bids provided a brief statement regarding both areas. Our department has a history of equipment maintenance with all three bidders. Based on our experience with maintaining equipment and ordering parts/supplies, the following order is how they ranked:
 - #1: Milton Cat
 - #2: Nortrax
 - #3: Beauregard Equipment
4. Operational Use/Durability/Effectiveness: Upon testing and inspecting the equipment for these categories, all Public Works Staff were in unanimous agreement that the following rankings apply:
 - #1: Milton Cat (Cat)
 - #2: Nortrax (John Deere)
 - #3: Beauregard Equipment (Case)

Overall Recommendation:

With all of the review criteria considered, it is my recommendation that the 2021 Caterpillar 420, in the amount of \$108,900.00, be awarded the bid for the purchase of the backhoe/loader:

Thank you for consideration of this review and purchase.

Cc: John Quartararo, Finance Director